



## 2020 E-scooter Pilot Vendor Selection

Three companies have been selected to participate in the 2020 pilot through an application process: Bird, Lime and Spin. All 10 companies who received a permit in 2019 were eligible to apply.

### **Selection Process**

The City drafted updated rules and minimum requirements based on last year's pilot and feedback from residents and community organizations. The City also developed questions and criteria designed to help determine which companies are most able to help the City meet its goals and which companies are able to run a service that goes above and beyond minimum requirements. These questions and criteria can be found in the Pilot Terms and Conditions. Four companies agreed to the refined rules and minimum requirements and responded with a completed application. Their answers were scored by a committee based on a rubric. City staff also scored each company's performance in last year's pilot. Applicants were notified that the 2-3 highest-scoring companies would be selected to participate. The City opted to select the 3 highest-scoring applicants.

### **Application Evaluation and Scoring**

Applications were first screened for completeness and proper formatting. Criteria from Section II of the Terms and Conditions were not scored, but instead, they were assigned either a pass or a fail. An applicant was required to pass all criteria in this section. Criteria in Section III of the Terms and Conditions were evaluated by reviewing each criteria item and assigning a score of 1-4 based on the rubric below. Each criteria item, across all applicants, was reviewed by the same individual to enhance consistency.

### **Scoring Rubric**

"1" ratings were given to responses that include rudimentary solutions, demonstrating the minimum level of commitment and ability to solve known challenges and concerns and meeting the minimum requirements.

"2" ratings were given to responses that include basic or typical, but unexceptional solutions, demonstrating a moderate level of commitment and ability to solving known challenges and concerns and meeting the minimum requirements.

"3" ratings were given to responses that include significantly more detailed and specific approaches demonstrating a higher level of commitment and ability to solving known challenges and concerns and significantly exceeding the minimum requirements.

"4" ratings were given to responses that include robust, unique, highly-specific or innovative approaches demonstrating the highest level of commitment and ability to solving known challenges and concerns and substantially exceeding the minimum requirements.

**Past Performance Criteria**

Past performance criteria were scored using 2019 pilot data or based on staff expertise. See Appendix 1 for details on past performance criteria scoring.

**Final Scoring**

The scores for all criteria items in a given category were then added up to create a score for that category. Each category score was weighted and then all category scores were added together so that the final application score was based on a total of 100 possible points. *See scores on page 3.*

**Pilot Background**

The City is conducting a second shared e-scooter pilot to learn more about the potential benefits the service can add to the city's mobility system and how to reduce potential negative impacts. Last year's pilot provided valuable insight, but some key questions remained unanswered. One important lesson from last year's pilot was that 10 different shared e-scooter companies operating simultaneously was difficult for the City to manage and confusing for residents. Limiting the number of operators also allowed the City to select only the companies currently best able to help the City meet its objectives and goals.

**Pilot Objectives**

The objective of the pilot is to determine: Whether e-scooters can effectively improve mobility for residents who face economic, social, educational and transportation barriers; Whether dangers for riders and non-riders can be substantially limited; Whether e-scooters can meaningfully reduce single-occupancy vehicle trips; Best practices and policies for managing a potential permanent program. The pilot also has a number of sub-goals that will be used to evaluate successes and shortcomings.

For more information on the e-scooter pilot, go to: <http://www.chicago.gov/scooters>

## Applicant Scoring

Question	Bird	Lime	Spin	Wheels
<i>Minimum Requirements</i>				
Provide images/specifications of devices to be deployed	Pass	Pass	Pass	Pass
Provide documentation that devices meet City code	Pass	Pass	Pass	Pass
Outline device safety measures	Pass	Pass	Pass	Pass
Provide plan for COVID-19 safety	Pass	Pass	Pass	Pass
Provide proof of insurance	Pass	Pass	Pass	Pass
Describe plan to procure and have ready required devices	Pass	Pass	Pass	Pass
Describe staffing plan	Pass	Pass	Pass	Pass
Has the applicant had a license revoked in the last 2 years?	Pass	Pass	Pass	Pass
Pass?	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes

### *Community Safety and Consideration (15%)*

Plan to improve proper device parking	3	3	3	3
Plan to ensure devices are locked to appropriate objects	3	3	2	3
Plan to reduce sidewalk riding	4	4	2	3
Total Score	10	10	7	9
Weighted Score	12.50	12.50	8.75	11.25

### *Accessibility and Consideration for People with Disabilities (15%)*

Plan to prevent devices from impeding travel for ppl w/ disabilities	3	3	4	2
Plan to employ auditory and visual signals to alert non-riders	3	3	3	2
Plan to offer adaptive devices	1	4	4	3
Plan to provide accessible app, website and phone support	4	3	3	2
Total Score	11	13	14	9
Weighted Score	10.31	12.19	13.13	8.44

### *Equity (15%)*

Plan to meet Priority Area distribution requirements	4	3	2	2
Education, engagement, outreach plan for Priority Area	4	4	4	4
Plan to improve access for people w/o a bank account	4	3	2	2
Plan to improve access for people w/o a smartphone	3	3	2	1
Plan to improve access for low-income residents	4	4	3	2
Plan to improve access for residents non-English speaking residents	4	2	2	1
Total Score	23	19	15	12
Weighted Score	14.38	11.88	9.38	7.50

### *Education, Outreach and Rider Safety (12%)*

Community engagement and outreach plan	4	4	4	3
In-app education plan, including for first-time riders	4	4	4	4
Plan to involve community stakeholders in outreach and education	4	3	4	3
Plan to meet specific required outreach and education requirement	4	3	4	3
Plan to make helmets accessible to riders	4	4	4	4
Plan to incentivize helmet use	4	4	3	4
Plan to adapt outreach and education during COVID-19	2	2	2	2
Total Score	26	24	25	23
Weighted Score	11.14	10.29	10.71	9.86

Question	Bird	Lime	Spin	Wheels
<i>Operations (15%)</i>				
Plan for deploying and redistributing devices, including incentives	3	3	3	3
Plan to prevent negative impacts of service vehicles	2	3	3	4
Plan to reduce operational environmental impacts	2	4	2	4
Plan to prevent over-crowding of devices in high-demand areas	2	2	3	1
Plan and capabilities to manage operations over large area	3	3	3	3
Plan for collecting, responding and documenting complaints	2	1	2	2
Approach to maintenance, cleaning, repair, safety checks of devices	3	3	2	2
Plan to quickly retrieve devices outside pilot area	2	2	1	1
Staffing plan for operations and maintenance, including local hiring	3	2	3	3
Plan for how service will complement and augment transit	3	4	2	2
Total Score	25	27	24	25
Weighted Score	9.38	10.13	9.00	9.38
<i>Technology and Innovation (3%)</i>				
How you would use visual and auditory alerts on the device	1	3	1	1
Plan for data sharing to help City meeting Pilot objectives	3	2	3	1
Plan to ensure data feeds are compliant w/ MDS and City standards	2	1	1	3
Total Score	6	6	5	5
Weighted Score	1.50	1.50	1.25	1.25
<i>Experience and Qualifications (10%)</i>				
Describe operating experience in comparable cities	3	4	2	3
Do you attest to having sufficient financial capability?	4	4	4	4
Total Score	7	8	6	7
Weighted Score	8.75	10.00	7.50	8.75
<i>Past Performance (2019 Pilot) (15%)</i>				
Data reporting capabilities	3	3	3	1
Rebalancing in Priority Areas	4	12	12	0
Ability to consistently deploy large number of devices	6	4	2	4
Fleet deployments in excess of limits	0	3	3	3
311 complaints per average active devices	1	3	2	3
Total Score	14	25	22	11
Weighted Score	7.78	13.89	12.22	6.11
<b>FINAL SCORE</b>	<b>75.73</b>	<b>82.36</b>	<b>71.94</b>	<b>62.53</b>

## **Appendix 1: Past Performance Criteria Scoring**

### **Past performance on data reporting:**

- 3 points if the applicant has no major data ingestion issues by the end of the pilot
- 2 points if Remix could not ingest the data by the end of the pilot, but no other major issues
- 1 point if neither Remix nor the City could ingest the data

### **Rebalancing and Priority Area compliance: The percentage of days for which data is available that a vendor met the priority area rebalancing requirement:**

- 12 points for applicants who were in the top quintile of performance among all 2019 vendors
- 8 points for applicants who were in the second quintile of performance among all 2019 vendors
- 4 points for applicants who were in the third quintile of performance among all 2019 vendors
- 0 points for applicants who were in the bottom two quintiles of performance among all 2019 vendors

### **Ability to deploy larger numbers of devices:**

- 6 points if the applicant's deployment averaged at least 200 or more scoters per day in at least 2 different months of the pilot
- 4 points if the applicant's deployment averaged at least 150 or more scoters per day in at least 2 different months of the pilot
- 2 points if the applicant's deployment averaged at least 100 or more scoters per day in at least 2 different months of the pilot
- 0 points if the applicant's deployment did not average at least 100 or more scoters per day in 2 different months of the pilot

### **Excess fleet deployment:**

- 3 points if applicant's deployment never averaged more than 250 scoters per day in any month of the pilot
- 2 points if applicant's deployment averaged more than 250 scoters per day in 1 month of the pilot
- 1 point if applicant's deployment averaged more than 250 scoters per day in 1 or 2 months of the pilot
- 0 points if applicant's deployment averaged more than 250 scoters per day in 3 or more months of the pilot

### **Number of 311 complaints, per 100 devices deployed per day (overall average)**

- 3 points for 15 or fewer complaints
- 2 points for 20 or fewer complaints
- 1 point for 25 or fewer complaints
- 0 points for more than 25 complaint